



**Legislative Assembly  
Province of Alberta**

No. 44

## **VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS**

Fourth Session

Twenty-Fourth Legislature

---

---

Thursday, May 18, 2000

The Speaker took the Chair at 1:30 p.m.

### **Presenting Petitions**

Mr. Wickman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Rutherford, presented a petition from 105 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

### **Reading and Receiving Petitions**

On request by Mr. MacDonald, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Gold Bar, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Mr. Dickson, Hon. Member for Calgary-Buffalo, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

## **Notices of Motions**

Hon Mr. Hancock, Government House Leader gave oral notice of the following motion:

Be it resolved that further consideration of any or all of the resolutions, clauses, sections or titles of Bill 19, Alberta Income Tax Amendment Act, 2000, shall, when called, be the first business of the Committee and shall not be further postponed.

## **Tabling Returns and Reports**

Hon. Dr. West, Acting Provincial Treasurer:

News release dated May 18, 2000, entitled "Alberta Chartered Accountants support tax Bill amendments" prepared by the Institute of Chartered Accountants of Alberta

Sessional Paper 981/2000

Hon. Mrs. McClellan, Minister of International and Intergovernmental Relations:

Letter dated May 17, 2000, from Hon. Mrs. McClellan, Minister of International and Intergovernmental Relations, to Hon. Tim Sale, Manitoba Minister of Family Services and Housing, and Hon. Jane Stewart, Federal Minister of Human Resources Development, providing an attached report, undated, entitled "A Framework to Improve the Social Union for Canadians' Mobility Provisions-Meeting our Commitments" prepared by the Government of Alberta

Sessional Paper 982/2000

Hon. Ms Evans, Minister of Children's Services:

Response to Written Question WQ23, asked for by Mr. Dickson on behalf of Mrs. Sloan on May 17, 2000:

What is the number of aboriginal children who moved from permanent guardianship status to adoption in the fiscal year of 1998-99?

Sessional Paper 983/2000

Response to Written Question WQ25, asked for by Mr. Dickson on behalf of Mrs. Sloan on May 17, 2000:

What negotiations has the Government been involved in regarding the status of Aboriginal adoptions and what reasons have been identified as a result of these negotiations for the lack of placements approved by Aboriginal bands in the fiscal year 1999-2000?

Sessional Paper 984/2000

Mr. Dickson, Hon. Member for Calgary-Buffalo:

Graph, undated, entitled "Bill 11 Debate Times" showing debate time in hours at the various stages of debate on Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act  
Sessional Paper 985/2000

Mrs. Sloan, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Riverview:

Report dated April 13, 2000, entitled "Policy Framework: Homelessness 'Draft' Implementation Strategy"  
Sessional Paper 986/2000

Mr. Sapers, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glenora:

Report dated May 2000, entitled "Alberta's Single Rate Tax: Implications and Alternatives" prepared by Melville L. McMillan, Department of Economics, University of Alberta  
Sessional Paper 987/2000

Statement made by Hon. Dr. West, Acting Provincial Treasurer, on May 17, 2000, regarding the Budget 2000 surplus  
Sessional Paper 988/2000

Letter dated May 18, 2000, from I.H. Jadusingh, M.B., B.S. FRCPC, to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, regarding comments made by the Premier in the Legislature concerning Dr. Jadusingh relating to private, for-profit health care  
Sessional Paper 989/2000

Mrs. MacBeth, Hon. Leader of the Official Opposition:

News release dated May 18, 2000, entitled "Official Opposition calls for fair tax cuts" prepared by the Alberta Liberal Caucus  
Sessional Paper 990/2000

Letter dated May 4, 2000, from Corey Anderson, Barrhead, to Hon. Mr. Kowalski, Speaker of the Legislative Assembly, expressing support for Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act, and concern regarding the Government passing Bill 11 without first holding a referendum despite considerable opposition to the Bill  
Sessional Paper 991/2000

Letter dated May 12, 2000, with associated attachment, from Charlene Hooper, St. Albert, to Mrs. O'Neill, Hon. Member for St. Albert, requesting reimbursement for a prescribed MRI (magnetic resonance imaging) test  
Sessional Paper 992/2000

Ms Leibovici, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Meadowlark:

Report dated May 18, 2000, entitled "Report on Schools in Edmonton-Meadowlark" prepared by Ms Leibovici, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Meadowlark

Sessional Paper 993/2000

Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona:

Letter dated May 18, 2000, from Bryan A. Quinn, St. Albert, to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, and Mrs. O'Neill, Hon. Member for St. Albert, expressing opposition to Bill 18, Alberta Personal Income Tax Act

Sessional Paper 994/2000

Hon. Mr. Mar, Minister of Environment:

Responses to questions raised on March 20, 2000, Department of Environment, Designated Supply Subcommittee 2000-2001 Budget estimates consideration by Committee of Supply

Sessional Paper 995/2000

Ms Olsen, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Norwood:

Report dated April 2000, entitled "Joint Recommendations on Issues of Curriculum Change" prepared by the Capital Region School Boards

Sessional Paper 996/2000

## **Oral Question Period**

During Oral Question Period, Mrs. MacBeth, Hon. Leader of the Official Opposition, tabled the following:

Response to Written Question WQ149 (tabled by Hon. Mrs. McClellan, March 2, 1995) asked for by Mr. Sapers on March 1, 1995

Sessional Paper 997/2000

During Oral Question Period, Hon. Dr. West, Acting Provincial Treasurer, tabled the following:

Report dated October 1998, entitled "Alberta Tax Review Committee-Final Report and Recommendations-Future Direction for Personal Income Taxes in Alberta" prepared by the 1998 Tax Review Committee

Sessional Paper 998/2000

Report, undated, entitled "Budget 99 - A New Tax Plan for Albertans-Government of Alberta Fiscal Plan" prepared by Alberta Treasury

Sessional Paper 999/2000

Report, undated, entitled "Budget 2000 - New Century. Bold Plans. - Alberta Tax Advantage" prepared by Alberta Treasury

Sessional Paper 1000/2000

## **Members' Statements**

Ms Kryczka, Hon. Member for Calgary-West, made a statement regarding the 100th anniversary of the First Lutheran Church in Calgary and congratulating Pastor Remo Madsen and the Church's congregation for being such a strength to the spiritual community.

Mr. Dickson, Hon. Member for Calgary-Buffalo, made a statement regarding the Canada Privacy Commissioner Annual Report 1999-2000 and its contents relating to the misuse of social insurance numbers, personal health insurance numbers, and problems with surveillance in public places and work sites.

Mr. Pham, Hon. Member for Calgary-Montrose, made a statement regarding the placement of aboriginal and ethnic children in foster homes where the language and culture are totally different, and his concerns surrounding this issue.

## **Projected Government Business**

Pursuant to Standing Order 7(5), Mr. Dickson, Official Opposition House Leader, asked a question pertaining to the order of Government Business to be brought before the Assembly for the following week.

Hon. Mr. Hancock, Government House Leader, gave notice of projected Government Business for the week of May 23 to May 26, 2000:

Tuesday, May 23	(4:30)	- <b>Government Bills and Orders</b>
		<b>Third Reading</b>
		Bill 24
		<b>Second Reading</b>
		Bill 20, 22

		<p><b>Committee of the Whole</b>  Bill 3, 19  And as per Order Paper</p>
	Eve.	- <b>Government Bills and Orders</b>
		<b>Second Reading</b> Bill 20, 22
		<b>Committee of the Whole</b> Bill 3, 20, 22, 18, 19 And as per Order Paper
Wednesday, May 24	Eve.	- <b>Government Bills and Orders</b>
		<b>Committee of the Whole</b> Bill 3, 20, 22, 18
		<b>Third Reading</b> Bill 18, 19 And as per Order Paper
Thursday, May 25	Aft.	- <b>Government Bills and Orders</b>
		<b>Third Reading</b> Bill 3, 20, 22, 18, 19 And as per Order Paper

## **ORDERS OF THE DAY**

### **Government Bills and Orders**

#### **Committee of the Whole**

According to Order, the Assembly resolved itself into Committee of the Whole, and the Speaker left the Chair.

(Assembly in Committee)

And after some time spent therein, the Acting Speaker assumed the Chair.

Progress was reported on the following Bill:

Bill 19 Alberta Income Tax Amendment Act, 2000 — Hon. Mr. Day

Mr. Severtson, Hon. Member for Innisfail-Sylvan Lake, tabled copies of the amendment considered by the Committee of the Whole on this date for the official records of the Assembly.

Amendment to Bill 19 (Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glenora) — Debate adjourned

Sessional Paper 1002/2000

### **Third Reading**

The following Bill was read a Third time and passed:

Bill 24 Wilderness Areas, Ecological Reserves and Natural Areas Amendment Act, 2000 — Hon. Mr. Mar

### **Second Reading**

On the motion that the following Bill be now read a Second time:

Bill 18 Alberta Personal Income Tax Act (\$) — Hon. Mr. Day

19. Oral notice having been given on Wednesday, May 17, 2000, Hon. Mrs Nelson moved the following motion:

Be it resolved that debate on Second Reading of Bill 18, Alberta Personal Income Tax Act, shall not be further adjourned.

The question being put, the motion was agreed to.

Debate continued on the amendment introduced by the Hon. Member for Edmonton-Meadowlark, on May 15, 2000, that the motion be amended by deleting all the words after “that” and substituting the following:

Bill 18, Alberta Personal Income Tax Act, be not now read a Second time but that the Order for Second Reading be discharged, the Bill withdrawn and the subject-matter be referred to the Standing Committee on Law and Regulations.

Pursuant to Government Motion 19 and Standing Order 21(2), at 5:33 p.m. the question was immediately put on the amendment to the motion for Second Reading of Bill 18, Alberta Personal Income Tax Act, with Hon. Mr. Kowalski in the Chair, which was defeated. The names being called for were taken as follows:

For the amendment: 10

Blakeman  
Carlson  
Gibbons  
Leibovici

MacBeth  
Massey  
Pannu

Sapers  
Sloan  
Wickman

Against the amendment: 35

Amery	Graham	Melchin
Boutilier	Haley	Nelson
Broda	Hlady	O'Neill
Burgener	Jacques	Pham
Cardinal	Johnson	Renner
Coutts	Klapstein	Severtson
Doerksen	Kryczka	Smith
Ducharme	Laing	Stelmach
Evans	Langevin	Stevens
Fischer	Lund	Thurber
Forsyth	Mar	West
Fritz	Marz	

Pursuant to Government Motion 19 and Standing Order 21(2), at 5:45 p.m. the question was immediately put on the motion for Second Reading of Bill 18, Alberta Personal Income Tax Act, with Hon. Mr. Kowalski in the Chair, which was agreed to. The names being called for were taken as follows:

For the motion: 36

Amery	Graham	Marz
Boutilier	Haley	Melchin
Broda	Hlady	Nelson
Burgener	Jacques	O'Neill
Cardinal	Johnson	Pham
Coutts	Jonson	Renner
Doerksen	Klapstein	Severtson
Ducharme	Kryczka	Smith
Evans	Laing	Stelmach
Fischer	Langevin	Stevens
Forsyth	Lund	Thurber
Fritz	Mar	West

Against the motion: 10

Blakeman	MacBeth	Sapers
Carlson	Massey	Sloan
Gibbons	Pannu	Wickman
Leibovici		



## **Adjournment**

Pursuant to Standing Order 4(a) regarding Victoria Day, the Assembly adjourned at 5:58 p.m. until Tuesday, May 23, 2000, at 1:30 p.m.

---

Hon. Ken Kowalski,  
Speaker

Title: Thursday, May 18, 2000